

Indian International Students in Canada: Migration Trajectories, Educational Experiences and Economic Outcomes | Transcript | CIRCLE

This is a text transcript of the webinar “Indian International Students in Canada: Migration Trajectories, Educational Experiences and Economic Outcomes” presented by the Canada India Research Centre for Learning and Engagement (CIRCLE) at the University of Guelph. The webinar was recorded on August 5, 2020 and was moderated by Dr. Ben Bradshaw. The guest speakers were:

- Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts, Professor, Department of Geography and Environmental Studies, Wilfrid Laurier University
- Dr. Sutama Ghosh, Associate Professor, Department of Geography & Environmental Studies, Ryerson University
- Dr. Binod Khadria, Former Professor of Economics, Education and Migration, Jawaharlal Nehru University

Transcript:

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Welcome everybody. It looks like we are slowing down in our populating of individuals to the screen. Welcome, delighted that you've been able to join us today for this online webinar focused on Indian international students in Canada, migration trajectories, educational experience, and economic outcomes. The webinar has been organized by The University of Guelph's Canada India Research Center for Learning and Engagement, better known as CIRCLE, under the leadership of Dr. Sharada Srinivasan.

Please allow me to start by acknowledging that the University of Guelph resides on the ancestral homelands of the Anishinaabeg peoples and more specifically, the traditional territory and now treaty lands of the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation. Those of us currently residing in Guelph also honour our Anishinaabe, Haudenosaunee and Métis neighbours, and express our commitment to recognizing and respecting the rights and interests of all First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples who presently call Guelph home.

My name is Ben Bradshaw, I serve as the AVP — Assistant Vice President — of graduate studies here at the University of Guelph. Among our 600 international graduate students at the University of Guelph, Indian students are our most populous. While many are pursuing thesis-based research, a notable number are with us to complete course-based master's programs, like our Master of Engineering for which they are paying out-of-pocket in the hopes of securing advanced training, a well-recognized degree, and for many, a post-graduate work permit. A PGWP, which I think we'll hear lots of today.

Given this evident phenomenon at the University of Guelph which we know operates on much larger scales across Canada at both Universities and Colleges, I as AVP of Graduate Studies feel obliged to better understand it and to ensure that the University of Guelph is doing all that we

can to support students needs and interests. This is not easily done, not just in light of the COVID-19 pandemic which clearly has disrupted studies of international students in Canada, but even pre-dating COVID-19.

This worry about meeting students expectations, or perhaps more broadly my worry about Canada meeting its end of an implicit contract with India in its training of roughly two hundred thousand Indian national students at universities and colleges across this country, first started to develop what I had the great fortune of attending the slightly delayed 50th anniversary of the Shastri Indo-Canadian Institute in New Delhi last November.

At that meeting in Delhi, it was there that I learned of the significance of the flows of Indian students to Canada. Where I heard from some Indian University Vice Chancellors, the equivalent of Presidents here in Canada, that were surprised by the caliber of the Indian students that were being accepted into some of Canada's universities and colleges, and listen to former Indian high commissioner to Canada, his excellency Mr. Vikas Swarup, suddenly speak of the need for Canada to attend to a relationship that based on his simple back of envelope calculation, generates annual revenues in the billions of dollars for Canadian universities and colleges.

Of course, these worries of mine are countered by a long and productive history of student exchange between Canada and India of which the University of Guelph is happily apart. Indeed the 52-year existence of the Shastri Institute reflects this long and positive history but given the evolution of the relationship especially in the last decade it is a good time to direct our attention to it in ways that we as academics are familiar. You can therefore see why I'm delighted to be chairing this webinar today, to have the opportunity to learn from three experts on Indian international students in Canada, migration trajectories, educational experience and economic outcomes.

We will first hear from Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts, who is a professor in the geography and environmental studies department at Wilfred Laurier University, and is affiliated to the Balsillie School of International Affairs in Waterloo. Her research has examined international migration with a focus on gender and skilled migration, an immigrant and refugee settlement and integration in Canada. Her recent co-ed publications include *Diaspora's Development and Governance* with the Springer Global Migration series, *The Human Right to Citizenship: A Slippery Concept* at The University of Pennsylvania Press, and later in this year a national project: *Canada's Syrian Refugee Resettlement Experience* with McGill-Queen's University Press.

Following Dr. Walton-Roberts, we will hear from Dr. Sutama Ghosh, who is an associate professor in the department of geography and environmental studies at Ryerson University in Toronto. Trained in urban social geography, Dr. Ghosh examines the migration and settlement experience of immigrant and refugee newcomers in the Canadian urban milieu. Using intersectionality and mixed research methods, Dr. Ghosh has authored several peer-reviewed journal articles and book chapters exploring the interplay of structural group and individual

level factors that lead to various urban inequalities among immigrant families. Dr. Ghosh's current research focuses on the resilience of international students in Canadian cities.

Finally, we'll hear from Professor Binod Khadria, who is a former professor of economics, education, and migration at JNU University in New Delhi, where he has been the founding director of International Migration and Diaspora Studies project from 2008 to 2018.

Professor Khadria was the inaugural ICCR Chair Professor of Contemporary Indian Studies at Rutgers University in the U.S. for the 2017-2018 academic year. And as a visiting professor he has also taught at universities in Australia, Japan, Singapore, The Netherlands, Switzerland, France, Ireland, the U.K., and the U.S. He has been a recipient of two prestigious fellowships: The Times Fellowship in India, and The Fulbright Senior Fellowship in the U.S, and presently he's also an invited adjunct professor of economics at Cotton State University.

Professor Khadria's areas of expertise include the economics of education, international trade and services, transfer of technology, and law and governance and education. These publications are too many to list here but let me draw attention to *The Migration of Knowledge Workers*, *Second Generation Effects of India's Brain Drain*, which was published by Sage in 1999, and most recently, in his role as editor and co-editor, *The Sage Handbook of International Migration*, published by Sage in 2019 and *The World Migration Report 2020*, which was a publication of the U.N Migration agency in Geneva.

Thank you to our three speakers for joining us today. Each will have ten minutes to present their initial thoughts to get us thinking, and then at the conclusion of these three talks we'll open up the floor to questions which ideally will be submitted to me, using the chat function. If you would prefer to offer your short question through chat, we can, I'm sorry, through video, we can certainly enable that. So, I will now turn the floor, or I guess the screen over to Dr. Walton Roberts, thank you.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

Thank you very much Dr. Bradshaw, for that. I am just starting to share my screen and then we can begin. So, thank you for the opportunity to be involved in the interesting CIRCLE seminars, they've been very rich, the ones I've been engaged in and I'm really appreciative to my colleagues Sutama Ghosh and Binod Khadria for joining me in this conversation, joining CIRCLE to present their work. So, I have 10 minutes to sort of lay out some of the more macro mentions of Indian international students in Canada and so I have 10 slides, so I'll get through them rather quickly and I hope to follow up with questions later.

My interest is more on the migration trajectories and so what I'm going to talk about is some of the basic data, the numbers of international students in Canada, and then also I'm looking at some of the information that's come from express entry for 2019, and express entry is the method that Canada uses to allow applicants who are temporary migrant workers, temporary residents, to apply for permanent residence. And international students, under the immigration regulations, are considered as temporary residents, and so they are able to apply for permanent residency through express entry, and so express entry data allows us to capture

some idea about what's happening in terms of international students and their transition into permanent residence.

To begin with what we know in Canada, as Dr. Bradshaw outlined, is that international students have become an increasingly important group of temporary residents who are significant for the economic contributions they make. In 2018 the calculations considered that international students brought about \$21 billion into the Canadian economy, which is considered to be more significant than the export of car parts, lumber and aircraft parts. That's pretty significant and therefore, they become a very important focus of interest.

We can see over the last 10 years here the number of international students has increased, and there are all kinds of ramifications around that including as we're exploring the international experience of students but also their migration trajectories, because they're increasingly, as was indicated, migrants temporary migrants, international students are interested in permanent residence opportunities.

On-screen content:

Dr. Walton-Roberts presents a bar chart showing the number of Canada study permit holders on December 31 of each year from 2009 to 2018. The total number of international students increases each year, starting at 204,010 in 2009 to 572,415 in 2018.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

So, India is the top country in terms of sending international students to Canada. We can see by far in 2018 representing about 55 percent of the number of study permit holders in the country, so a focus on India is really significant in terms of our understanding of international students in Canada.

On-screen content:

Dr. Walton-Roberts presents a bar chart showing the number of Canada study permit holders by nationality at the end of 2018. 172,625 study permit holders were from India, followed by 142,985 study permit holders from China. All other sending countries represented fewer than 25,000 students each.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

Postgraduate transitions, and this is the important dimension of, so we have a large number of international students in Canada, a significant percent of those come from India, and one of the very appealing dimensions of international students being in Canada is the fact that they have a pathway to permanency. And that pathway to permanency can be sought out through Canada's immigration process, which is express entry.

Express entry is a pool where applicants are invited to apply, it's not a line as the old traditional system was, it's a pool and depending upon your comprehensive scoring, your comprehensive ranking score, you sit in that pool at a different level and every couple of weeks or months or

so, Immigration Refugee Citizenship Canada invites people to apply who are above a certain comprehensive ranking score.

And you can see that the express entry has really been targeting younger and more educated applicants, so this is based on 2017, 2018, 2019 data from express entry, and you can see that the share of those in the 20 to 29 year old group has increased and is the majority of those who are invited to apply. So, the express entry applicants are younger than the traditional federal skilled worker, which was the system we had before, so that's important to recognize, and of course that orients towards those international students.

On-screen content:

Dr. Walton-Roberts presents a table showing the number of express entry invitations issued by age in 2017, 2018, and 2019. In each year, just over half of all invitations are issued to potential applicants in the 20 to 29 age category.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

There's also, and they are also post-secondary educated and so again we can see in terms of the share of those applicants coming through express entry, a higher percentage have a post-secondary credential. So 42 percent, 48 percent in 2019 so here's that figure. So, they're younger, they're more educated, and all of this is orienting towards making international students prime candidates then for this conversion through express entry.

On-screen content:

Dr. Walton-Roberts presents a table showing the number of express entry invitations issued by highest level of education in 2017, 2018, and 2019. In 2018 and 2019, 42 percent of invitations were issued to potential applicants with a post-secondary credential of three years or longer and 48 percent of invitations were issued to potential applicants with a master's degree or entry-to-practice professional degree.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

And increasingly less work experience within Canada is expected, so we can see that the share of express entry candidates who are gaining entry who have no work experience or less than one year, has increased from 54 to 56, and from 29 to 31 percent, so again express entry is very much oriented to the characteristics these international students will have. They'll have a post-graduate work permit they will be working for one or two years but we can see that there is not necessarily a premium for having a significant amount of Canadian work experience.

On-screen content:

Dr. Walton-Roberts presents a table showing the number of express entry invitations issued by amount of Canadian work experience in 2017, 2018, and 2019. In each year, 95 percent of

invitations or more were issued to potential applicants with up to two years of Canadian work experience.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

The sectors that express entry candidates are in—that are converting increasingly are in information technology, and business and financial services. I've just been looking at some data of areas of study that international students from India are focusing and these are very much the areas that the majority of those students are engaged in.

Also, those in express entry who are being invited to apply are resident in Canada, so again they're targeting those people who are in Canada already who have studied for two or three years, who are working for one or two years, or in the U.S. close by, so this is where people are indicating they are currently resident, but when we look at which citizenship they have again we see the out-weighted importance of India in terms of the numbers. So over half of those who are getting express entry have Indian citizenship coming through express entry.

On-screen content:

Dr. Walton-Roberts presents a table showing the most common country of citizenship for express entry applicants in 2017, 2018, and 2019. In 2019, 40,275 out of 85,300 applicants had Indian citizenship.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

Now, express entry represents what's been called two-step immigration, and that's two-step in terms of coming in under one visa and then converting into another visa, and there are risks and rewards associated with the two-step process and this comes from some really important reports that have just come out from Stats Canada and Immigration Refugee Citizenship Canada.

Garnett Picot, Eden Crossman and Feng Hou have laid out and done some analysis on this two-step migration process and they've highlighted the risks and the rewards. The rewards are much better labour market integration, because people have already been in the country, they have been working in various sectors, they've made those important connections, there's much better job matching that occurs with the two-step migration. Data suggests there's better levels of income being earned, and the two-step migration can address regional labor market shortages because people are already dispersed across the country and they're making those networks and making that basic integrating within the labor market.

But there are also risks, temporary migrant visas with work privileges have been considered and this is by work from Gregory in Australia, he called them "privatized and uncapped" and so it's about the attraction for the educational sector which includes private vocational colleges, and the permanent visa allocations government led and capped, and so there's a potential imbalance there of the numbers of the pool of the temporary migrants who come, coming as students exceeds what the government is willing to provide visas for.

So, there is also risks of increased vulnerability and exploitation because the way those workers are on a temporary visa, so they have less rights. There's also the concern that this process will address short-term labor market needs and not address long-term ones, so it won't necessarily pay attention to some of the structural transformations that are facing economies. And there's also some concern that temporary, that domestic workers are neglected because of the growing call of temporary workers who are able to fill in different kinds of slots.

And there's some concern that this uncapped, temporary migration may become a means to an end, so it's not so much people coming in to gain an education, it's more about using education as a means to get permanent residence.

I'll just end on this slide because there's some interesting data and analysis. This comes from a report in the Toronto Star and they examined some reports issued by IRCC, Immigration Refugee Citizenship Canada, which suggested that possibly between 10 to 20 percent of international students may not be complying with their visa conditions, so they may not be registering or enrolling in their programs of study, they may not be showing up, there may be no record of them at the colleges where they've had a visa issued for them to work—to study there, and also there's some concern that status is not being reported by especially private institutions that are now eligible to attract international students.

So I think just to conclude, we need to recognize the enormous significance of international students to the Canadian economy, to the Canadian educational sector, to that we need to recognize the significance of India and the way in which Indian students are engaging in education and the transition into permanent residence, and the occupational sectors they're involved in but then there's also a word of caution of thinking about the policy problematic of this incremental ability between the privatized, uncapped, and the government-led capped transition into permanent residence and so I'll leave that there and hopefully my colleagues can build on and give us more detail.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Wonderful, thank you so much Dr. Walton-Roberts, so if you un-share your screen we'll be able to turn things over to Dr. Ghosh who again is an associate professor in the department of geography and environmental studies at Ryerson University.

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

Thank you everyone, thank you Margaret, actually as well for inviting me to join this webinar. It's a wonderful way to connect with everybody and thank you Dr. Bradshaw for that introduction and Sharada and Dr. Khadria, thank you so much.

So my research is on here, what I'm going to talk about today is on Indian international student assemblages in the GTA and I want to ask, you know, start this presentation by asking the question, is it necessary to have a more nuanced research that focuses primarily on colleges? And that's the argument that I'm going to make that why we need to study the experiences of international students in the colleges and also share with you some of my initial findings.

Before I start the presentation, I want to recognize all the research assistants who have worked on this project because of time constraints, I am happy to name them but because of time constraints I'm going to skip over that for now.

As Margaret has already discussed, I'm not going to spend too much time on this except that Canada is the third most popular destination right now and that is because primarily because of less tuition fees as well as because of the fact that people who come here can then transition into being permanent residents.

We find that among the international students who come to Canada, we find that they are about 12 percent of all students in the post-secondary sector and they contribute over \$12.8 billion in Canada's GDP which includes the tuition fees, living expenses, as well as labor contributions. I think Margaret said a number, I think she reported a number that is above that and that's excellent because these numbers are from, I think 2019.

What is important to notice here is that when people are coming from India they're not spreading equally throughout Canada and as it is in the case of other immigrants, most of them come to, I mean 42 percent of them come to Ontario and this is a graph that shows that there is definitely a concentration of them.

On-screen content:

Dr. Ghosh presents a slide showing that there were 642,482 international students at all education levels in Canada in 2019. A pie chart shows the distribution of international students to Canadian provinces in 2018. The largest proportions of international students studied in Ontario (42%), Quebec (20%), and British Columbia (19%).

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

What is interesting to note that yes, their numbers have increased very rapidly since 2010, however when you look at the various countries of birth from where they are coming, India has definitely a very important share, a very important role to play but I was pleasantly surprised to see that Bangladesh also had a 53 percent gain in terms of international students coming to Canada. Iran also has a formidable presence particularly in the engineering department in Ryerson in particular but I'm sure elsewhere as well.

So, the question is that, what is the new trend? The new trend is that many of them are now seeking college education or which is college diploma rather than pursuing university degrees so, many of us like Margaret and myself we came in here as international students, but we came to seek higher education as grad students. This new trend is known as bachelorization which Bozheva talks about, and the recent trend also show that one in four are coming to attend colleges.

The question is why, even though university education is supposed to be better and equipping them better to transition into job market, why are they seeking college diplomas? Is it by choice or are they being steered somehow? If they are steered, who's steering them, why and how?

And what are the effects? I think this is what I really want to engage with in my future research as well.

So, I want to just let people know here because I see a lot of international audience is that the college system in Canada is very different from the U.S. and India. In Canada we have community colleges, which are government funded, and then we have private career colleges, which does not receive any government funding, and depends on totally private tuition fees.

So previous research tells us that international students come to Canada as I said because of lower tuition fees and easier transition. The previous research also tells us that they face high tuition fees, issues with housing, employment, language abilities, which actually circumscribe some of the circumstance their abilities to do well in school. Also, they have insecure pathways to permanent residency.

A lot of work has been done on this. But the problem with this research is that this is primarily focused on university students and on Chinese students who also have different levels of the English language, compared to people from India, many of whom have a very good grasp of English.

There is also a lack of comparative research, so we don't know what is happening between institutions, because of the overwhelming focus on Chinese students, we don't know if this is the case with other students, we don't know about the demographic and social identities, how those particularly gender, how that may affect, and therefore there is, I see overall in the literature that there is a bit of structural determinism rather than accepting the issue of agency.

We also need to have a more sort of intersectional lens, adopt an intersectional lens, to study but above and beyond, and I think this comes primarily from actually Margaret's previous research where she looked at nurses coming from Kerala to Canada, is that this issue of transnational linkages needs to be really well studied and well researched.

So again, I'll make a case for why we need to research colleges again as I said in the GTA we have five community colleges: George Brown, Sheridan, Centennial, Seneca, and Humber, but we have over 200 private career colleges. I'm just going to tell you a small story that you all know about. So, this Sikh international student was driving from Montreal to Toronto, his truck, and there were some problems in the highway, and he had an accident, so there you go, the police basically caught him and said "hey, you are going to be deported because you're working more than 20 hours." Then while the investigation occurred, it was clearly that he did not actually go to a government community college, in fact, he went to a private career college.

This is important because even though the admission requirement and processes are somewhat different in the colleges, the permitted work hours are the same. So international students cannot work beyond 20 hours per week. So how was this happening what is, are there any differences in enforcement of these laws and above and beyond, why is this person having to work hours 40 a week full time while being enrolled in college? Is it even possible? So, something, there's a story here and perhaps a human story which is which we need to really understand.

This whole incident really made me think okay, let's start looking at the resiliency among international students attending colleges in the detail until now we have done 45 in-depth interviews with 15 key informants and 30 Indian international students, the work is still continuing. We are again going back to the three questions, why do they seek college diplomas? Is it by choice or they are steered? Who steers them? Why and how? This is what we have learned so far.

So, first thing that we have learned is the institutional engagement in this whole migration process, so we have found that there are education agents, it's all well known, in Canada who then recruit education agents in India who go to these various expos and education expos and talk about exactly what Margaret said, why they should come to Canada, how well they will be able to get through the express entry visa, and then become permanent residents. And in the process, many of these education agents whom I interviewed in India, actually do not talk about the university education at all. What they are marketing are these colleges primarily, also private colleges.

So, it can be argued that edu-schemes are being created in a sort of an artificial way where information is delivered to channelize these people or channel these people to particular colleges. The question of why they really come it really matters because as Margaret also said, that is it only because of education or is it for permanent residency. In our research we found that many students, as I said work full time so there is no, there is absolutely impossible for them to attend colleges yet they must attend those colleges in order to retain the status, full-time student status, otherwise they will be deported.

Second point I want to make is how they arrive is a very important part of this whole story, and the economic and social costs of migration need to be studied. Our study shows that the families in India take huge financial loans, between 70 thousand to 100 thousand Canadian dollars, but the responsibility to repay these loans falls on the shoulders of the students who must then work harder in order to save the extra dollars and send them home.

One of our major findings is that many of them suffer from food insecurity and although we often sort of say that okay food insecurity is a general factor that affects every student, I would like to, if I get a chance, to talk more about that and how this happens.

On-screen content:

Dr. Ghosh presents a slide with the following student quote:

"I wish I could buy whatever food I want, but I can't. After paying tuition, rent, and my transportation, then I also have phone costs... after all that, I have very little left. My goal is always to keep the expenses to a minimum, and earn more. This has been my motto since day one. If I make some extra dollars, I'd rather send home to repay loan. Eating is not essential – it is just something I need to do now to keep going."

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

Finally, there is no one Indian student experience—where they come from really matters; the context of departure. I'm going to quickly show you the map of India to show that the people we talked about, a lot of them came from metropolitan areas. But a lot of them also came from the villages, particularly in Punjab, whereas we know that the farm crisis is a tragic irony, a lot of these people are taking huge loans to send their children over to Canada.

On-screen content:

Dr. Ghosh shows a map of India, highlighting the state of Punjab and the National Capital Region (NCR).

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

We also found that they have to go through a process and in this regard, most of the immigration agents who actually help them write the English test etc., in order to qualify. So last but not the least, despite doing all this they are considered temporary migrants and therefore they are unable to apply for any kind of bursaries or apply for affordable housing or employment. Therefore, we should think of how we can help practice basically equity and reduce discrimination. I will end it here, I'm not sure about time.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Wonderful, thank you so much Dr. Ghosh for that presentation and certainly there'll be a chance a little bit later to speak to some of the food security concerns you expressed. I'm happy now to turn things over to Professor Binod Khadria who again is a former professor of economics, education and migration at JNU University in New Delhi. Dr Khadria thank you.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

Thank you, Professor Bradshaw. Well this was a very learning experience to listen to Margaret, I'm grateful to Margaret Walton, Professor Margaret Walton-Roberts for initiating this webinar and suggesting that I join her here, and of course professor Srinivasan for organizing this and inviting me, and then Professor Bradshaw and Sutama also joining the panel.

Well, I am going to focus on economic outcomes, and economic outcomes are actually not financial outcomes only, they are broader than that and this is where I would like to share many of the things have already been talked about by professor Margaret Walton-Roberts and Dr. Sutama Ghosh, so that makes it easier for me. This is the global picture, this is the rough estimate of 32 million strong Indian diaspora, and roughly half of them are still Indian citizens, and the others are PIO's, Persons of Indian Origin, who have naturalized into the resident countries citizenship and similarly the same story in U.S., in Canada and so on.

Canada on the right top corner you can see five percent of 32 million, half of them Indian citizens and half Canadian citizens, and I have this data now of 220 thousand, which is little

more than what Sutama had presented and Margaret Walton-Roberts, maybe there are variations of definitions or maybe updating is different but roughly we get the feel of the dimensions of how much decision one can compare about this in how much in other countries, United States of course is the ultimate destination, and then comes Australia and third is Canada.

On-screen content:

Dr. Khadria presents a pie chart showing the distribution of the Indian diaspora across regions of the world. Of the roughly 32 million people included in the diaspora, 32 percent live in Southeast Asia, 19 percent live in the Persian Gulf region, 14 percent live in the United States, and five percent live in Canada. These values do not include international students.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

I'm tempted to share this caricature from the U.S. department of justice presented in their annual statistical yearbook in 1991. It's only to represent historically how difficult it was for uneducated people to come to the United States at that time, the congress, U.S. congress was debating this bill on literacy tests that if you do not know English then you cannot come and it was basically working as Indians and other Asiatic people who were denied entry into the United States at that point in time. I have only 10 minutes so I would not like to go into the details of the story that time it was Woodrow Wilson who vetoed this bill three times, but it was still passed.

On-screen content:

Dr. Khadria presents a political cartoon depicting Uncle Sam looking down over the edge of a fortified wall at a family of migrants. The wall is labeled 'literacy test.' A flag planted behind the wall reads 'the land of the free.' The cartoon is captioned: "Keeping Brown Browns Out of the White West" and "In 1917... legislative measures... created a 'barred zone' designated to halt immigration."

Dr. Binod Khadria:

In Canada, this is historically very important, a hundred and six-year-old page from history: the Komagata Maru incident is well known and there have been celebrations and apologies and other kinds of memorials being held about this. In 1914, 376 immigrants from Punjab – Sutama had talked about Punjab, half of Punjab the mind is in Canada actually – and these people were not allowed to land there and they came back to India and then there were fatalities there.

So we need to connect this to within 50 years, within the 50 years that was the beginning of the 20th century, but by mid-century, mid 20th century, we had these IIT graduates and All India Institute of Medical Science Graduates, and you can see the proportion from medical science. This is a top of the line college, All India Institute of Medical Science. 56 percent of the graduates had left India for other countries, mainly to United States and maybe to Canada and U.K. and so on.

If we take the IIT, the average of the three IIT's, then it is about one in every four graduates and they were the best and the brightest and quality wise and they had left. So, you can see from uneducated illiterate migrants coming from Asia and India, to the best and the brightest in just about 50 years' time.

On-screen content:

Dr. Khadria presents the following data, illustrating that within roughly half a century of the Komagata Maru incident, many STEM graduates of leading higher education institutes emigrated from India to more developed countries:

- AllIMS, New Delhi – 56% of graduates from 1956-1980 cohorts emigrated
- IIT Madras – 27% of graduates from 1964-1987 cohorts emigrated
- IIT Bombay – 31% of graduates from 1973-1977 cohorts emigrated
- IIT Delhi – 23% of graduates from 1980-1990 cohorts emigrated

Dr. Binod Khadria:

This was also mentioned that the loan educational loan has been a burden on the students and the families and this is proliferating, and now we have at least four times a year the world education fairs in India and this time I notice it is online because of the COVID-19, and what I noticed that over the years, over the decades, the age profile of the students going for international education, and asking for loans is coming down from post-doc to PhD to master's level to bachelor level as Sutama had mentioned, and then it is also coming to high school level, international baccalaureate and so on. So, we do see these are all the symbols of the banks at the right bottom corner you can see about this.

But this is something which is, I think is increasingly most of the high-skilled Indians would now move through the academic gate as it is called, and my professor had called them semi-finished human capital, so that you go at the bachelor level or the master's level and then you top it up with a PhD, and that is what was happening earlier the labor market entry was separate professionals were going from India. But over time we find in the phase one to phase two that there was overlap education market had ng pathways that Margaret Walton-Roberts, professor talked about and Sutama also referred to.

So, there was an overlap and that overlap has, in phase three, increased by giving them PR status and so on, and in the fourth stage of sustainable development goal and the global compact on migration, we probably are going to have an intensity of this education market, the academic gate, is going to go on. I don't have to share the data that are there, USA with 1.1 million, Australia 700 thousand, Canada I have 642 thousand and out of that, as I said 220 thousand, which may be exaggeration or latest figure.

On-screen content:

Dr. Khadria presents a slide that illustrates an immigration trend of the last few decades. Before 1991, most Indian immigrants entered directly into the labour market of a host country, having

already completed their education. Since then, the education market and high-skilled labour market have begun to overlap, as more immigrants arrive in host countries as international students. Increasingly, immigrants stay in host countries as the path to permanent residency becomes more accessible.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

Now what is happening in terms of the outcomes of the most developed countries the receiving countries has been on security concern that we have seen post 9/11, going up and the visas to students, etc., starting with the United States have been coming down, and that was an occasion for Canada and Europe and Australia to capitalize on student migration, post 9/11.

But security concern was one issue for cautiousness for visa issues and so on visa conditions, and other was integration, like social cohesion within society. So, Canada had the multicultural religion and Europe had the problem of integration, and otherwise that's why the return migration was being considered that they need not stay on, need not settle down.

I look at it as understated economic benefits to the host countries, in this case Canada, but hidden cost to the immigrant families in India, and I call it 'age,' 'wage,' and 'vintage'. In terms of case this is compensating the low growth of the people in Canada and other countries, European countries and so on. It was last decade we had only four percent in the 18 to 24 the growth rate was 18 to 24 age group in Canada, whereas the overall growth rate was 11 percent.

So, you can see and if the migrants are rotated through temporization, then the migrants aging would remain young, you know, they will not age. Their cohort will remain younger and that would neutralize the local population. And that on the other side would lead to temporization of migrants and marginalization to precarious informal labor markets in their home countries. So that I think is something important, there is a contradiction there, there is a conflict of interest.

And similarly, I look at the wage factor, that if they are younger than their wages are low, their perks are nil, and there is no question of pensions and others. But, at the same time if we look at the destination country like Canada, in case of Canada, it sustains 170,000 jobs in the Canadian higher education sector, or perhaps the entire education sector. And then Canadian society or the government doesn't have to give unemployment dole. That I think is a benefit which need to be taken into account, but on the other side, on the counterpart side, we find "nomadization" of migrant families, a lower purchasing power parity, cuts into savings, and remittances. Why nomadization? Because if you are a temporary migrant you tend not to take your family along.

And finally, we come to vintage, that is the student population, this is the student migration. And that's where the figure that I have for Canada is the saving is 22 billion dollars and Sutarna had given it as 12.2 billion, maybe this is again in the year in which it is counted. I had got it from the ICES. I see reverse remittances, how much of this money comes back? We celebrate remittances to the origin countries but how much money comes back to the destination country.

In the case of India, the 15 percent of the remittances that India gets actually flows back and I call it 'silent backwash' flow of remittances. Then there are their future workers because many of them have the pathways to permanent residency and then citizenship and become the, you know settle down there itself in the countries. In the case of United States, 60 to 80 percent, in the case of Canada perhaps we need to find out.

And then of course this is knowledge accumulation because many of them, increasing proportions are STEM graduates, STEM fields, and latest vintage of knowledge is embodied amongst them and I call it in India or in the origin country, it creates a Freudian segregation of human capital because the education fairs call them fairs of recruitment of students, which to me is a Freudian term because what is at the back of the mind is the future workers, not students. Otherwise, they would have called them enrolment.

And this I share with you, President Obama's concern in 2014 state of the nation he said, "are we a nation that educates the world's best and the brightest in our universities only to send them home to create business in countries that compete against us?" This is the economic outcome, it's divided. "Or are we a nation that encourages them to stay and create jobs, businesses and industries right here in America?"

This was important and I think it followed on during his election campaign also he talked about no to Bangalore in terms of tax cuts and so on. Now in COVID-19 era, we find the executive orders of President Trump, the U.S. industry is worried about consequences of temporary ban on green card, which is permanent residency H-1B, L-1, and attempted ban on student visas, F-1, which of course had to be withdrawn because of large-scale protests and threats of suing them into the courts by MIT, Harvard and the tech giants also trying to join them.

And now, yesterday only we find that there is a new executive order saying that American citizens cannot be fired from their jobs, so we are into topsy-turvy world, and this is where I find from Margaret Walton-Roberts's presentation, not only here but last week in India, that Canada is an exception. Canada is not going the way America is going where the risks are higher and that is where we need to take.

If we look at India's benefits then of course, the stereotypes are remittances, last year India had 83 billion in remittances, I call them celebration, we don't look at the dark side of the evidences, how they are constructed. We don't have time right now but during Q and A, perhaps we can come back. Return of technology; technology does not come free, it has royalty issues under WTO negotiations we have seen them creating problems, and then return migration with value added human capital.

This is an argument for saying that well the brain drain is no longer there because people are going back. I think there are wheels within wheels in this, we need to be looking into these into detail and what economic outcome we have seen for the destination country, we have seen for the origin country.

But we don't talk about the migrants themselves and in this case, it is students here and Indian student migrants in Canada, their benefit is the pathways to earn while learn, they can do the

work permit and where just now Sutama had shared that they exceed the number of hours that are being allowed to work and earn, and then we have common residency citizenship. And the last one, which is very important from India's point of view, is the OCI, Overseas Citizenship of India, which is actually a semi-dual citizenship kind of a right that is being given to Indians who have become citizens of other countries, and their parental lineage it comes back to India.

I don't have time to explain this diagram here, but I think it's self-explanatory. If you come to the temporary route, temporary migrant route, you have a possibility to become permanent resident and then naturalized citizens and then dual citizens. Once you are dual citizens, your connection with your home country, in this case India, will become stronger because you can come and go, come and go to and fro. You don't have the risk of being denied entry again.

On-screen content:

Dr. Khadria shows a diagram that illustrates typical cycles of migration and the different paths to citizenship of temporary, permanent and circulatory migrants.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

I had attended this in Australia in 2015 and ACOLA, Australian Council of Learned Academies, had released this smart engagement with Asia. This was a report and I found Australia's statement very bold there, it said, "Australia's engagement with Asia has too often been characterized by short-termism, opportunism and focus on monetary gain. Smart engagement, by contrast means more than pragmatic emphasis on economic benefits, and working towards nurturing wide-ranging, long-term, deep, and mutually beneficial relations, based on the principle of reciprocity."

And specifically, on migration it added, "smart diaspora diplomacy should not focus on serving the national interest only; instead, it can be a vehicle for transcending national divides to embrace broader global perspectives and common interests." I think this resonates into the sustainable development goals and later on in the GCM in 2018.

It was an irony that Australia itself withdrew from the GCM, following United States of America, but Canada did not withdraw. Canada has not only adhered to the objective of GCM, but reason to the challenge of COVID-19 with future-friendly immigration policies including towards the students and their families.

The economic consequences would be positive and sustainable if gains are equitably shared, and Sutama Ghosh had told us what is the difference between equity and equality, so if they are shared equitably then between Canada and India, and the student migrants and their families as the first stakeholders, for that the two countries need to follow unilateralism supplemented by bilateralism. I have no longer any faith in multilateralism because that is not based on the principle of equity. It is based on behind the scene game theoretic strategies.

So Canada seems to be gearing up to meet the COVID-19 challenge to migrants and to my mind these are the, out of objectives of the GCM, these specific ones are very important: basic

services to migrants of health and education, first one is fair and ethical recruitment which is number six, and then nurses were pointed out and that I think in the case of COVID-19 context now it is very important, and then we have mutual recognition and skill development and certification and the remittances faster, cheaper and safe because the students when they become permanent residents they do flex and their remittances even from Canada.

And portability of social security contribution and earned benefits back to the countries of origin of return is totalization that I think is a big issue in the United States, if you cannot get a claim on that until you have you have contributed for 10 years.

Two conditions I tend to focus on: one is the instability in the visa issues. That I think we need to address, and I say all goods and services around the world have a best before date, but the visa policies do not have a best before date. When is it going to change? Is it going to change in one year, one week, three days, or five years? Nobody knows and nobody can plan, that's why in terms of which education stream one should go for which is going to be less risky. That needs to be addressed and international norms and code of conduct for ushering user-friendly visa and border security regime that I think, Canada is making a beginning through Canada's express entry as we just heard.

Can there be a smart engagement between India and Canada? I would say one recommendation, which is contrary to GCM, is that we need not anymore depend on unreliable multilateralism. We should call that it is enough and to try other ways of either unilateralism or bilateralism. And there is enough for India even to make a beginning after this national register of citizens which created havoc in India, followed by this amendment of the Citizenship Act in 2019.

All those drowned down under the COVID-19, but otherwise India was going through a very tough time. So, we need to understand the migrant problem as stocks and flows, not stocks or flows. Sorry we have to look at them as stocks or flows not stocks and flows. So, flows can be controlled, but stocks need to be taken care of. And that's where we need to invest in their human capital through education and health and make them contribute to the GDP, that we heard how much GDP is contributed by the migrant students and others in Canada.

I call it inter-diaspora cooperation, thinking out of the box or diaspora thinking about homeland country. But I think we have given enough time for that, we should think of inter-diaspora cooperation across countries, across origin and destination countries and then dual citizenship for STEM because STEM is in global short supply and we should think of global commons, there are already five global commons, and we can think of a sixth global commons in terms of human capital; particularly STEM including the health workers.

Finally, I would say there are three preconditions: one is that we should address the dementia in consular practices because every time you go for a visa you have to give the same paper again and again, and that is cutting the trees, it is environment unfriendly. We have to have the best before dates, at least some promise that we will not change drastically our visa policy in the next three or four years until we come across a crisis like COVID-19. And then save migration statistics from becoming "lies and damned lies" and that I think is important.

Inter-diaspora cooperation — I tend to share with you, I am from Assam. Professor Margaret Walton-Roberts had presented- taken part in a webinar last week in Assam. And this is something which is Assam Association of North America (AANA), and you can see the maple leaf of Canada, although there is the American flag, which is overlapping the hand woven Assamese red and white towel — I don't have colour picture here — and then on the right bottom you see a vessel, which is the symbol of Assamese culture.

So there can be integration of this kind which would give us inter-diaspora cooperation. This is pan-Indian returned Non-Indian resident's association, and this was there when I was writing my first book The Migration of Knowledge Workers doing field work all over India, in Bangalore this was an organization. Ten years later I went there, it vanished. All of them went back. India could not hold them there. Back to serve, they had come with that motto, but they had to go back. Thank you. Sorry, I've taken a little longer.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

That's okay, thank you so much. Wonderful presentations from the three, you can imagine it was a bit of a challenge to limit their comments to ten minutes, so I appreciate that you were able to do so. That gives us time for questions and I've been receiving some questions through the chat feature and that certainly is the preferred way to go if people are willing, but at a later point in time we can open up to questions from the floor or from the screen if need be so.

Let me start with a couple of those questions and Dr. Khadria, I'll come right back to you with a question, a clarification question, a little bit later in your presentation you proposed dual citizenship for STEM students. One of the participants was trying to get clarification of that, not fully understanding the point, why wouldn't that be true for non-STEM students, students in the humanities and social sciences? What's the significance of dual citizenship for just STEM? Thank you.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

Yeah, well, that is to make a beginning you see you cannot open the entire Pandora's Box at one go. Certainly, I am a social scientist, I would like if I come to Canada and get my PR and citizenship of course, I would love to have the dual citizenship. But there is a way to, as a steppingstone, if you are from India you have the OCI which is semi-dual citizenship for across the board it is not for not for only dual citizens. It is for everybody.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Great, thank you.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

You just can't stand in India's elections that's the only exception you can't buy plantation land but other than that you can actually get everything.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Okay. Thank you, I might pose this question to Dr. Ghosh, there were some questions around mental health issues with international students especially during the COVID-19 pandemic and how universities like Ryerson are trying to support international students, either those remote trying to learn remotely, or those that are with us and dislocated from home. Dr. Ghosh, is this something you'd be prepared to speak to?

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

Not really, because I haven't done research on this, however the literature tells us a lot about mental health issues that international students suffered from and that is primarily as a result of not having a sense of belonging. I mean from the literature we know that there is a disconnect and even though they come with all these hopes, at the end of the day many of them feel that they are not connected to Canadian society.

However, I want to again re-assert the point that this is primarily on, this research is primarily on Chinese students, so we need to know what is happening with other groups and to what extent the Chinese students seek support. All this work needs to be done—I mean, there is a huge gap in the literature to my knowledge in this regard.

With respect to Ryerson, I know that Ryerson, like every other university and college, has an international student office and I normally see people in and out when, you know, pre-COVID state. We are just launching a few research studies, hopefully they'll be funded to look at the impact of COVID on international students from India, but that research is not ready as yet.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Okay. Dr. Walton-Roberts, I don't know if you want to expand on that, but can you also speak a little bit to the broader question of how our Canadian universities and colleges dealing with a number of international student concerns during COVID, the COVID-19 pandemic. Could you speak to either of those? If you have a sense of, sort of either what we are or what our role should be?

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

Okay, and again like Sutama, I haven't done work on in terms of the mental health issues that international students have faced. I have worked with a colleague who has done some analysis on the experience of Chinese international students in terms of their experiences and I think one of the important things is to recognize, we tend to have this assumption of integration being a kind of a linear process, but I think the reality is that for students as they move through different phases, so if they come for pre-language training and then they move into a particular degree program, I mean they begin again the process of integration and so it's a very staggered experience as an international student.

And so, I think we have to suspend our assumptions about integration being kind of smooth and mono-linear because it's not it can be very choppy and so making our services oriented to those different stages is important to recognize. Now during COVID-19, we have an even more choppy experience and so we've had very significant disruptions felt by our international students who are facing concerns about what's happening to their families overseas and depending upon where they come from, they have different kinds of levels of concern around COVID.

I know at Wilfred Laurier, faculty have been using different kinds of methods to keep in touch with their international students. This is mostly research based in graduate program so I can only imagine the disruption and concern that's experienced by students who don't have such a close connection to a group like so a lab for example or another group of students. Then of course the COVID disruption continues for incoming students because we, currently the model is that they don't actually get to arrive in Canada, they can take their program remotely it still gives them credit to the postgraduate work visa up to a certain percentage of their program.

That may change because a significant dimension of integration is outside of the basic learning I mean there's so much more extracurricular co-curricular processes of integration and interaction, and even if you're not necessarily in the classroom there are, there is potential for that to happen so, I think we still have to pay attention to what the Canadian government's going to do because it may change depending on what's happening. I hope that answers.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

That's great. So certainly, I can speak to what the University of Guelph has been doing. In the summer time we provided the graduate level supports for all students including international students and course-based masters in an unprecedented manner, automatic supports which I think many of our course-based master's students were pleased to receive, and then of course augmented funds and bursaries so that we could we could cover those with need.

And we were pleased to see that over the summer access to those bursaries by international students was less than we had expected. We know that many international students in non-funded programs were counting on part-time work, online work, and a lot of that work has disappeared. So, we are particularly worried about that and we continue to have that worry and so those bursary programs are still available in the fall and the eligibility requirements have been loosened.

So that's been our response and that's been a response that we've seen right across the board. Canadian universities and colleges have a vested interest in having these students join us either remotely to begin or certainly ideally in person, and there's a pretty significant lobbying effort with the federal government to try and open up borders to students with study permits. But that's an ongoing discussion between universities, colleges and the federal government.

Dr. Khadria can I turn back to you for a moment please? I appreciated your praising of the Australian Council of Learned Academies report, and you outline what it would look like at a national scale to, if you will, take the relationship to the next level. Could you comment on what

you would hope or expect universities could do in a really practical way, because your expectations were largely at the national sort of governmental level. What can universities and colleges do to bring that relationship to that next level that you described?

Dr. Binod Khadria:

Thank you for posing that very important and pertinent question. We, being from the education sector and particularly from the universities, I think you need to be, you know, in terms of what is feasible and what is not feasible. Pragmatically we I think one, that is within our domain, one action which is in our domain is to introduce forces which address these issues from the perspective of different stakeholders in the entire migration scenario so to say, the migration play I call it, the migration play which takes place on the world stage.

We need to identify first who are the stakeholders, because many times we do not understand, or our students don't understand our government, or our policy makers do not understand who the stakeholders are. That is very important. Whether the immediate family members—who are the immediate family members? That is a variety of questions are issued sociologists would look at it separately in terms of looking at societies like India where extended family networks are quite close to each other whereas if you go to certain other countries or westernized countries then you find nuclear family becomes more important.

So, we see what affects whom. That I think is very important and it also involves the flow of resources in terms of making migration happen, for example we had this example of Punjab in India. Now in Punjab going abroad is something a dream, you know it is a dream. There are there are temples which are called the visa temples. Before you go to take your visa apply for your visa you go and pray before the God and make a negotiation that if I get my visa then I will do this. I will garland you or I will help the beggar or something like that.

And there's so much of psychological stake there if you do not succeed then there are issues of drug addiction and other things which are in fact one of my graduate students has done a work a PhD work on failed migration in Punjab. So that I think is very, we need to address those issues because the human cost is enormous and that I think it is not the end of the world that I think we have to address this through our courses, our extension work, our public lectures, and so on.

That I think is within our domain that is step number one and then of course we have to convince the conflict of interest, we have to address the conflict of interest when there are so many stakeholders the origin country and what is the middle part? Where is the optimization? You know, you cannot maximize everything by for just one stakeholder you have to distribute it equitably.

That I think has to be understood and that's where I say we have a disjoint between policy and practice. We have to address this, we have to actually orient, give an orientation program to those who sit on the on the immigration posts who allow you to come in where you have a one-to-one interaction with that immigration officer who can just violate the policy and there is no evidence of how they are violating the policy. They take the law into their own hands, and then

they treat people like from the global south in a very different manner than they treat the people from the global north.

Many times, my friends, my white skinned friends from the global north did not believe me when I said this. But, once I kept on saying for 10 years, the same thing, then they started seeing it. They said we know you were right now we see it otherwise we are colour-blind, we don't even try to look at it. So once we start bringing this on to the table, that I think will go a long way this is what I think our constituency of the intellectual constituency of teachers of students or faculty of administration in the university sector where we can play with our coursework we need to bring that in as a mainstream.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw

Thank you, there was a good question for Dr. Ghosh. A change of topic certainly, there was appreciation for your focus on the geographies of migration one of the participants was curious to know if you had done any work to analyze the caste or class of migration as part of that work. Dr. Ghosh, can I turn things to you?

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

Yeah, so in our interviews most of the time we did not we did not directly ask questions about caste, but class definitely emerged as one of the main issues, and as Professor Khadria just said and Margaret has done a lot of work on Punjab so it's not even my place to even say anything, but what I learned is that in Punjab the whole scenario of migration has changed. Earlier it used to be that these people come here as Professor Khadria was saying, with less education then have family reunification, but what we saw now is that the youth of Punjab are simply coming out.

They don't have any other option but to take these huge loans and come over. And class, it was so interesting because when I was talking about, you know, I had assumed that these people who are coming to do bachelor's degree in Canada must be very rich because I personally come from a middle-class background. I have to wait I passed out in my master's from JMU in '91 and I came here in '99 because I had to wait I had to work as a college professor to get some money then pay for my tuition fees or and plane ride and all that.

But the point is that I just simply assumed from my own experiences that they must be all rich. But the point is that they are not rich people are selling up their farms people are, so class just simply came emerged as one of the most important questions that I need to work on. I feel like I have only scratched the surface. There is so much to do and people who came from Gujarat, which is the state from where Narendra Modi comes from.

Yeah—it's another story—it's just incredible amount of complexity in these stories and I think that to what extent should Canadians be concerned about that? So, at the back of my mind I was thinking is it important for Canadians to know where they're coming from and what kind of political economic conditions are coming from. Yes and no, I guess.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Yeah that's a wonderful question and I want to get this to you, Dr. Walton-Roberts, if I could because I think the whole question of Canada's obligations is an important one. So, I can just allow you to respond Dr. Walton-Roberts, but I wouldn't mind posing a more particular question to you. When I was in attendance at the Shastri Indo-Canadian Institute Meetings in New Delhi last November, there was talk about enabling Canadian colleges to be part of that organization which wasn't of great interest to the board at the time.

My interest in that would be because universities need to be working, I think more productively with colleges and you spoke of some of these private colleges which are under-representing registration or sorry, under reporting registration and hence in violation of immigration law. Is your sense that as a country and as a sector we need to do a better job of, if you will, sort of managing the experience of international students, especially Indian students in Canada be there at university colleges or private colleges in which you spoke?

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

Okay, so if I can respond to those two issues but first just to follow on from Sutama's comment, I mean I have done quite a bit of work looking at the experiences of Punjab in terms of its relationships with Canada and I have written about the, kind of *longue durée* – the long-term relationship between these two places, India and Canada, but especially Punjab because that has been the traditional regions from which many immigrants from India have come to Canada.

When you look at it over the *longue durée*, what you see is the, what I've argued, is the important influence of policy, Canadian immigration policy, on transformations within Punjab and that orientation to what is it that Canada is requiring? What does it need? So, as Professor Khadria indicated, the story of the Komagata Maru is an important moment in part of that development based within the kind of colonial history and the connections and then the sort of extreme racist policies that were developed in Canada at the beginning of the 1900s.

Then what we see as we move through the Second World War period and into the 50s and 60s, there's various transformations that demand more labor for kind of manufacturing for the growing industrial basis of the Canadian economy so Canada moved from the desire to sort of open up the agricultural heartlands and that was where we saw that engagement with a number of migrants from Punjab coming in, land ownership this was especially evident in British Columbia, fascinating history about that kind of again the racist legislation that almost funnelled people into certain kinds of occupations including agricultural.

And they couldn't even own agricultural land in some cases and so there was similar as in the U.S. these kind of interesting negotiations and partnerships that were formed to allow people to actually have some kind access and ownership over the land through partnerships with white settlers. But then, as we move to '50s and '60s it becomes manufacturing, industrial, that becomes the orientation and it's fed through family class immigration this is evident with the Italian, South European migrants, but especially also within with the South Asian population.

So family migration becomes the means of entry now as we get into the '90s and beyond our focus, our fascination is on the high skilled, human capital, we change our policy instruments to measure it in intimate detail, and thus we have our federal skilled worker program became extremely bloated, massive backlogs then we moved into express entry. Express entry is a finely targeted, as I said it's a pool, it's not a line, and comes as a two-step migrant, temporary worker, permanent resident.

So, policy becomes a very nuanced instrument by which Canada extracts the value it requires, but we can't miss the focus on what do these policy changes do in the sending regions? I've particularly looked at the case of India, Punjab and other parts of the country as Sutama and Binod have as well but I'm sure others can see this happening and I think we want to pay attention to international students, also because the Canadian government has doubled down on the significance of international students.

There was just a provincial, territorial meeting where ministers, the minister of immigration and other provincial immigration ministers recognized the significance of international students to their regional economies, and the Canadian government is investing money in diversifying where they draw international students from.

They're obviously aware of the out-weighted importance of India it right it raises geopolitical concerns, if something should happen and India suddenly looks elsewhere so Canada's responsibility is "yes, we have a policy framework, we must pay more attention to the impact that has in other locations," and I think as Professor Khadria says, you know express entry can emulate some of the best practices for when it comes to visa processing that is devoid of the ability for discretion to become racialized and biased.

I mean, I would say, based on the numbers, that India is not getting a good shake right, are coming in either through international students or through express entry that is happening, but we still need to pay attention to those nuances. We need to understand what's happening in the sending areas that's Canada's responsibility, we gain a huge amount from the immigration model. We need to monitor what we do; we need to pay more attention to what's happening, and I think this speaks to your issue about Canadian colleges.

There is an interest in gaining a college education, public colleges in Canada are very well thought of, Sutama's work has shown us how there is an interest in gaining Canadian education in colleges because it is relatively cheaper. It's also much more oriented to the labor market compared to universities, so it's beneficial. I think Shastri is sort of has positioned itself always as the university connection and they're realizing that the colleges are more important, but they don't want to be seen as the kind of recruitment arm for international students.

So, they have to think carefully about what their position is in terms of that, and so it's an interesting question to address because in some ways the sort of chauvinism that's attached to going to college as opposed to going to university, but in some cases the colleges can be very important partners in this. And it is a partnership, and it is effectively like a contract because we're saying "come to Canada, spend all this money to get some education," but we're also

promising this pathway to permanent residence. We cannot ignore the fact that that's part of that contractual engagement. So, we have to live up to our end of the deal.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Thank you. Let me segue to another question that was posed by the director of circle Dr. Sharada Srinivasan. She's asking all of you to put down your data in your research and to just do some reflection what you think it might look like post-COVID for Indian students in Canada. What do you think the prospects are going forward for Indian students in Canada especially around securing permanent residency? Why don't we start with you Dr. Khadria, in terms of outflow of Indian students post- COVID?

Dr. Binod Khadria:

Very brief answer, I think it is the fluidity of the situation. It is the uncertainty, which is looming large, which is creating wide scale anxiety amongst the prospective students, students who have got admission in this financial in this academic year but have not been able to join their semester are in the limbo. They don't know because, COVID-19 projection is for a short it is, from short term to short term kind of projections that lockdowns are put in place and extended month after month.

There is no certainty as to when this is going to be, as I said the best before date is not there. The best before date is not there so, whether they should try to take admission, an alternative admission in an Indian institution here to fall back upon, or if they have put their money and other resources into it already then what will be the fate of this? And nobody can tell them.

That is the saddest part is that nobody can predict what is coming, because although there are some encouraging trends in terms of number of incidents going down, but they are topsy-turvy. So I think students within India have been following have been facing lot of uncertainty in terms of whether examinations will be held or not, whether terminal end of the term examination should be held or not, and whether they can go on to the next level of education or enter the labor market or not.

So, the stakes are very high and tricky for the Indian students at the moment and they cannot put their eggs into different baskets. That is the dilemma, you know they are tied down by this one-way route of the education process that we have so far India just passed the education bill, the new education policy has come into effect only this week which was a bill lying underrated in the parliament for more than a year, and this is where we find that the flexibility of changing streams midway, or getting out into the labor market exit midterm exit, those things are being introduced now.

But we are still at the beginning of the road, we don't know which way this will take us and which way this is going to take the students. The students are still a confused lot in terms of if they're in the middle of the courses then which one, which route they are going to choose. Whether the new pattern or the old pattern because the bachelor's degree now is being made

as four-year program from a three-year program so these are ifs and what's are there and this situation is that of confusion that I think only time can tell us.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Okay, thank you. Dr. Ghosh can we ask you to look into your crystal ball, what will things look like for Indian students coming to Canada post-COVID?

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

Some of my friends, some of the people I know here actually are immigration agents and sort of they are consultants. With respect to graduate students going to universities, it's not so much of a concern as professor Khadria said, those who are coming to the colleges is a major concern because often graduate student admissions would be done based on what they've done last year but college students who couldn't even give the exam, they couldn't sit for the exams, it's all stalled sort of thing.

So again as I said I think research needs to be done, I can only speculate that college students who are enrolled going back to the issue of ghost enrolment, I we don't know, there's a lot to be done. We don't know to what extent they are actually interested in the education part of it, those who are going to private career colleges etc. I am actually more concerned with people who are here right now and how COVID-19 has affected them and one of the main issues is with respect to the problems they faced with housing. They had to still pay rent and without a job and now they are slowly going back to normal but yeah, I am more concerned with that.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Thank you so much and Dr. Walton-Roberts, same question for you please and we'll wrap it up after this.

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

Yes, along with my colleagues I would say I don't know, I mean it's a tough one. I can talk about this from two perspectives—one is my own experience as a graduate director for our geography program, a joint program at Waterloo/Laurier, and what I found interesting is that there's actually been a surge of interest kind of late into the recruitment season as I think people's plans have been disrupted and they've certainly thought "you know what, I could go back to school and I could do some study," including people who actually want to do the online remote part.

So, there are those who are sort of jumping on the opportunity the disruption of covert to actually engage in some graduate education which is much more flexible for them because they don't necessarily have to be in situ, so that that's been interesting to see. In terms of the bigger kind of analysis, there was recently a CBIE webinar where the large international educational recruitment company IDP reported on a survey that they had done of international students

and their intentions, and the interesting thing they found is that Chinese students are much more likely to not travel because of COVID-19 for various kind of security concerns.

Whereas with Indian international students is fairly stable there is still a high degree of interest in gaining that international education even in light of the disruption caused by COVID-19. So that would suggest, and coupled with Canada's commitment to international students, that would suggest that this trajectory might continue and COVID might be a kind of a blip and it might kind of, certain things may fall out, but the general trajectory is in position.

There have been some comments by labour economists that really Canada maybe shouldn't be so obsessed with the skilled labor migration and should actually take this opportunity to enhance family and humanitarian class migration.

Many families that's what they want, they want to reconsolidate their extended, their larger families they want to bring their relatives together so this concern that has been experienced through the family unit and so that has been an argument because until we know what's happening in the labor market maybe we should ease off on continually bringing in skilled migrants who we assume are going to fit into certain boxes. Just go more for family class, reconsolidate those units because they are the basis of how we manage to survive many of these crises. We call upon that kind of unit, so I'm not sure if that answers it but.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Well, no, but I appreciate that comment as we wrap up—that's a thoughtful thing to end with. So on behalf of any everyone who's joined this webinar and there have been lots of comments which I'm not sure if our presenters have been able to read through, there's been lots of appreciation for today's talk, indeed many thanks to all three of you; Dr. Khadria, Dr. Walton-Roberts, Dr. Ghosh.

Dr Khadria, I think it's coming on 10 p.m. in India so thank you especially for extending your workday. This has been really illuminating for me so thank you to all of our speakers and before we go, Sharada asked me to promote the next webinar which is about a week away on Wednesday August 12th at 11 a.m. eastern standard time. There'll be a focus on from farm to fork agri-food supply chains and the fallout of COVID-19 lockdown in India.

So with that I will bid everyone farewell and thank you to everyone who's joined us for today's webinar brought to you by CIRCLE and again to our three speakers, really a wonderful experience for me so thank you for the opportunity. Any final words from any of our speakers?

Dr. Margaret Walton-Roberts:

I'd just like to thank you, Ben and thank our panelists and thank Sharada and CIRCLE group for hosting the webinar. It's been a really interesting experience and I've enjoyed several of the webinars that you've hosted so I'm really grateful to be part of this.

Dr. Binod Khadria:

Right yes, I joined Margaret Walton-Roberts, my long-term friend and you mentioned it is late in India but and I didn't miss my food because I had food for thought. Thank you very much.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw:

Dr. Ghosh?

Dr. Sutama Ghosh:

Thank you so much. Okay I learned a lot. Wonderful.

Dr. Ben Bradshaw

Certainly, everyone should know that there will be a recording that's available of this webinar at a future date so come back to the CIRCLE website for that. Okay everyone, bye-bye and thank you.